Archives of Management and Social Sciences
2026, Vol: 03, Issue: 01, Page No. 70 – 85
RESEARCH ARTICLE
OPEN ACCESS

Non-Cash Transactions, Deferred Payment Fraud, and Anti-Money Laundering Compliance in Livestock Markets: A Criminological Perspective

Ejaz ul Islam[1] | Muhammad Faisal[2] | Arsalan Ahmed[3] | Nadir Ali[4] | Syed Mohsin Ali Shah[5] |

[1]Lecturer, Newport's Institute of Communication and Economics Karachi –NICE
[2]PhD Candidate, University of Karachi, Criminology Department
[3]Ms. Scholar, Preston University
[4]Ms. Scholar, Newport Institute of Communication & Economics -NICE
[5]Ms. Scholar, Muhammad Ali Jinnah University - MAJU

Received: 04 December 2025
Revised: 26 December 2025
Accepted: 23 January 2026
Published: 31 March 2026

Correspondence:
Ejaz ul Islam
Lecturer, NICE
Email: eulislam@gmail.com

To cite this article: Islam, E., Faisal, M., Ahmed, A., Ali, N., & Shah, S. (2026). Non-Cash Transactions, Deferred Payment Fraud, and Anti-Money Laundering Compliance in Livestock Markets: A Criminological Perspective. *Archives of Management and Social Sciences, 3(1), 70-85*
DOI: https://doi.org/10.63516/amss/03.01/005

Abstract

Purpose: This research aims to assess the correlation of non-cash transactions, deferred payment fraud, and anti-money laundering (AML) violations at livestock markets in Pakistan during the Eid-ul-Adha season. The study analyzes how criminals leverage the gap in regulations, informal payment systems, and social capital to conduct financial crimes at smallholder livestock farmers.

Methods: This research applies a qualitative criminological approach, and through market practices and the regulatory frameworks and sociocultural contexts that define/enable fraud, employs interpretive analysis. This research incorporates two theories of criminality, routine activity and differential association, to contextualize deferred payment fraud in the livestock trading system.

Conclusion: The findings show deferred payment fraud being systematically used by privileged buyers to obtain livestock at high prices and later transport the livestock to a different market. These buyers arbitrage the market's instability caused by Eid-ul-Adha and transport the livestock to a new location to begin the fraudulent scheme again. The study identifies serious AML gaps caused by the cash-based and trust nature of most livestock transactions and facilitates layering and integration of dirty money into the legitimate economy.

Contribution: The study supports the registration of large livestock buyers and the implementation of enhanced due diligence for seasonal livestock traders, as well as urging regulatory reform to digitize livestock markets. The study also offers the integration of livestock markets within the national AML regulatory framework. It also has important implications for policy and practice.

Value: This research contributes to a small yet important body of literature focused on the intersection of money laundering and criminality at informal livestock markets. It also provides a much-needed context to the AML compliance discourse to fit in the realities of global agriculture and developing countries.

Keywords: *Anti-Money Laundering, Deferred Payment Fraud, Livestock Markets, Non-Cash Transactions, Criminological Perspective, Eid-Ul-Adha, Pakistan, Routine Activity Theory.*

ISSN: 3007-2115
Publisher: Allied Nexus Publisher
http://amss.alliednexuspublisher.com/

1. INTRODUCTION

Livestock accounts for 14.4% of Pakistan's total gross domestic product (GDP), which makes the livestock sector an integral component of Pakistan's entire agricultural economy. Additionally, the livestock sector supports 8 million rural households. Beyond its economic importance, the livestock trade has great significance in Pakistan's religious and cultural heritage, especially during the days leading up to Eid-ul-Adha, the Islamic festival of the Sacrifice. This festival memorializes Prophet Ibrahim (alayhis-salam) and his son, Prophet Ismail (alayhis-salam), and their willingness to carry out the sacrifice at the command of Allah. The act of this sacred civil disobedience is known as, Sunnat-e-Ibrahimi, and is the highest form of worship in Islam, as it is an epitome of submission and the willingness to sacrifice one's most beloved for the sake of Allah.

Qurbani, established by the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him), is an important Sunnah of immense spiritual value. Aisha (may Allah be pleased with her) reported the Prophet of Allah (SAWW) said: "The most beloved deeds to Allah are those done during the first ten days of Al-Adha'' (Sahih Al-Bukhari). In addition, the Prophet (SAWW) used to sacrifice each year, and ordered his companions to do so, and he (SAWW) cursed those who do not sacrifice as reported in the Sunan At-Tirmidhi: "Whoever has the means but does not sacrifice, let him not come near our prayer place.'' So these orders made Qurbani a spiritual and social obligation of those who can afford it. As the meat of the sacrificed animals is distributed among their family, relatives, neighbors, and the poor.

Thus Eid-ul-Adha is more than just a trading event; it is a time to show humility to God and to the less fortunate and to remember that joy during the celebration must be accompanied by the act of giving. The celebration is a reminder to Muslims that sacrifice is the purity of devotion, and not of blood and meat. As Allah stated in the Quran: 'It is neither their meat nor their blood that reaches Allah, but it is piety from you that reaches Him.' (Surah Al-Hajj 22:37). Eid-ul-Adha, however, has become a commercial event with the Spiritual side of the celebration backseat to the finance and economics side. The ritual has become a representation of wealth and social status. The Sunnah has become a luxury reserved for the rich. The artificial inflation of livestock prices through practices of bullionism and market speculation has made it almost impossible for the financially challenged to fulfill the Sunnah. This has obliterated the equitable spirit that the festivity is based upon.

In recent years, Pakistan's livestock markets have emerged with complex deferred payment fraud schemes. These schemes are of grave concern because they financially exploit small-scale farmers, and because informal and unregulated transactions can facilitate money laundering and other criminal activities. Combining high seasonal demands, informal and unregulated trading practices, increase of criminal trading networks, and the absence of adequate oversight create a perfect environment for financial exploitation (Ullah et al., 2024a). Found mostly in cashless transactions, coupled with a general aversion to maintain records, low regulation oversight, and a strong reluctance to formalize deals legally, these markets provide a prime venue for financial transaction crimes and money laundering (Raza and Ahmad, 2023).

Even though the issues have grown both in size and severity, the informal livestock market remains a neglected area of research in financial crime studies. Acknowledging the recent priorities of the Financial Action Task Force (FATF, 2024), the research on improving anti-money laundering (AML) compliance has focused primarily on formal banking and real estate sectors and the formal financial sector, at the expense of the informal sector, and agricultural markets, in particular (Chaikin and Sharman, 2023).

This research bridges a gap by undertaking a criminological analysis of non-cash transactions, deferred payment fraud, and AML issues specific to livestock markets in Pakistan. Focusing on the innovations of fraudulent actors and the socio-cultural contexts that are most enabling of their activities, plus the regulatory frameworks that provide the most hindrance and lack, this research uses routine activity theory (Cohen and Felson, 1979) and differential association theory (Sutherland, 1947). This research will contribute to the literature on financial crimes in the informal economy and provide some policy recommendations for ameliorating AML issues within this sector, which is important yet neglected.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Anti-Money Laundering Frameworks and the Informal Economy

The existing AML regulations and the FATF's 40 Recommendations provide a broad framework for national and regional regulations for money laundering risks in formal banking networks, money service businesses, and designated non-financial professions and businesses, such as realtors, lawyers, and accountants (FATF, 2023a). Although regulations have been developed, many scholars have described the challenges of this approach, while most have recognized that the majority of financial flows occur within the informal economy (Chaikin and Sharman, 2023; Reuter, 2024). The application of AML within the informal economy presents numerous challenges due to the large unregulated economy and the absence of record-keeping and tax collection frameworks (Siddique, 2024).

The Anti-Money Laundering Act, 2010 (AMLA) dictates Pakistan's AML regime. Responsibility for oversight of AMLA is with the Financial Monitoring Unit (FMU). The FMU has shown positive growth in the banking sector's reporting of suspicious transactions. The FMU has also worked to further compliance in the banking sector. Still, the challenge of incorporating the informal economy within the scope of AML continues (State Bank of Pakistan, 2025). Agricultural markets and livestock trading are especially difficult to address in this regard. Cash occurs with transactions of informal money and credit in these markets with no identification of either party, no value recorded, and no time of payment recorded (Hussain and Malik, 2023). This regulatory gap exists in other countries as well. Concerns have also been outlined for informal livestock markets in Bangladesh and India and other countries in Sub-Saharan Africa (FAO, 2024)

The reports of the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) regarding Pakistan's mutual evaluation indicate challenges with management of informal economy money laundering risks, especially in sectors with cash intensive activities, deficient regulation, and complicated ownership structures. Pakistan must broaden its AML (Anti-Money Laundering) policy to include other sectors and activities predominantly transacted through informal means. This advisory highlights the critical importance of AML and informal market gap research to create cost-effective strategies to improve compliance.

2.2 Fraud in Agricultural and Livestock Markets

Emmanuel et al. (2023) describe several ways agricultural markets in the developing world are plagued with fraud. These range from falsification of input to manipulations in weighing and measuring, to false grading, and even unfair contract agreements. Fraud also exists in the livestock sector and includes the sale of animals that are sick, drugged, and even misrepresented breeds and ages. Deceptive payment practices also contribute to livestock fraud. The focus of this paper is on payment fraud to the effect of systematic deferred payments. This form of payment fraud is patterned and carried out by trading partners working together as a group, and leverages the volatility of the market and trust-based systems of trading. Fraud of this nature is well documented by market participants and practitioners, but has been largely ignored by scholars.

The use of deferred payment contracts in transactional relationships known as 'baki' or credit sales in South Asia, is prominent in South Asian livestock markets. Such arrangements allow farmers to expand market reach and buyers to source stock with no need for immediate cash in turn facilitating trade (Ahmed and Raza, 2023). However, these arrangements are informal and trust based, thereby providing the necessary tools for

Archives of Management and Social Sciences
2026, Vol: 03, Issue: 01, Page No. 70 – 85
RESEARCH ARTICLE OPEN ACCESS

exploitation. More often than not, buyers default on their payment obligations, leaving the seller with little legal recourse, especially in unstructured markets characterized by an absence of documenting transactions, systematic registrations of buyers and sellers, and marked social-economic imbalances in the buying and selling of goods (Ullah et al., 2024b).

The seasonal nature of the livestock markets, in particular the rush leading up to Eid-ul-Adha, worsens the problem. Demand for slaughter livestock rapidly increases, leading to high market prices and creating a reluctant and aggressive trading environment. It has been documented that during such rapid changes in market conditions and prices, trading participants become highly vulnerable to fraudulent activities. The combination of the trading environment (informal credit), highly seasonal trading and unregulated trading presents the necessary and sufficient conditions for the type of systematic fraud in deferred payments that this study examines.

2.3. Criminological Theories and Market-Based Fraud

Financial crime analysis in market transactions integrates several different theories which describe the mechanisms and variables that characterize crime. Routine Activity Theory argues crime happens when three conditions are present: a motivated offender, a suitable target, and an absence of a capable guardian. In the case of livestock market fraud, the motivated offender is a fraudulent buyer looking to obtain livestock without full payment. The target is the smallholder farmer with valuable livestock, while the lack of guardians is apparent in the gaps of formal legal protections and market oversight. The concentration of high-value transactions in the livestock market within short spaces of time creates predictable patterns of criminal activity.

Differential association theory, developed by Sutherland (1947), provides a supporting framework for the study of the acquisition and normalization of fraud within the livestock trading community. Bonding within an intimate personal group is central to learning the skills that constitute criminal behavior, as well as the articulation of the means, the motives and the justifications for the criminal behavior. In the context of the livestock market, the livestock trading community has developed a fraudulent system based on the practice of deferred payment. Within this system, the older and more experienced buyers teach the less initiated participants how to create fraudulent deferred payment systems (Sherif and Ashraf, 2024). The trading community's acceptance of payment systems combined with the lack of regulatory frameworks provides fraud with the persistence and the opportunity for continued growth.

ISSN: 3007-2115
Publisher: Allied Nexus Publisher
http://amss.alliednexuspublisher.com/

AMSS Archives of Management and Social Sciences
Archives of Management and Social Sciences
2026, Vol: 03, Issue: 01, Page No. 70 – 85
RESEARCH ARTICLE OPEN ACCESS

The 'fraud triangle' has also been applied to the study of white-collar and occupational fraud. In the livestock trading markets, the speculative nature of the trading practices creates both the pressure for the fraudulent trading, and the opportunity for such fraudulent trading (Akhlaq and Ahmed, 2025). When this is combined with the rationalization that 'everyone does like this' and that the victims of the trading activity are actually benefitting from the inflated prices, fraud becomes all but inevitable.

2.4. The Religious and Cultural Context of Livestock Trade

To comprehend the essence of Eid-ul-Adha and the practice of Qurbani, one must delve into the primary narratives of Islam. The Holy Quran tell us about Prophet Ibrahim (AS) and his dream from God, commanding him to sacrifice his beloved son Prophet Ismail (AS). The Prophet Ibrahim (AS) and Ismail (AS) both came to the point of receiving the divine command when Allah released Ismail (AS) and replaced him with a ram, ordering Abraham to sacrifice the ram instead. This sacrifice completed the supreme test of Faith (Surah As-Saffat 37:102-107). This event is known as Sunnat-e-Ibrahimi, and is the epitome of unflinching monotheistic faith and practice, and is one of the most virtuous acts in Islam.

The Prophet Muhammad (SAWW) exemplified and explained the relevance of this practice through his practice and explicit instructions and said: 'The son of Adam does not perform any action on the day of sacrifice which is more pleasing to Allah than the shedding of blood. He will come on the Day of Resurrection with its horns, its hair, and its hooves, and the blood will be accepted by Allah before it falls to the ground, so let your hearts be content with it' (Sunan At-Tirmidhi, Hadith 1493). The Prophet (SAWW) also raised the issue of the communal aspect of Qurbani and ordered that the meat of the sacrificed animal be divided into three: one for the family, one for friends and relatives, and one for the poor and the needy (Sunan Ibn Majah). Through these instructions, Qurbani is not simply a slaughtering ritual, but a full worship practice that includes commitment, generosity and social intimacy. More recently, the secularization of Eid-ul-Adha has led to an emphasis on materialism and social one-upmanship. The effects of the change of the Qurbani livestock market from a community-based trading system to a speculative profit-making market has been documented by many scholars (Rashid and Bari, 2023; Mahmood and Noor, 2024). The financing of Qurbani has become a burden for ordinary families due to the combination of speculative hoarding, real demand, and criminal conduct. The artificial inflation of the price of animals has become a barrier to the observance of the Sunnah. The Quran states that the meat and blood of animals reach Allah and is not of consequence, but the piety of a person is what Allah is concerned with (Surah Al-Hajj 22:37). The commoditization of Qurbani is, thereby, a counterproductive and anti-thetical distortion of the spiritual intention of the act.

ISSN: 3007-2115
Publisher: Allied Nexus Publisher
http://amss.alliednexuspublisher.com/

2026, Vol: 03, Issue: 01, Page No. 70 – 85

3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

A qualitative approach is appropriate as it captures the complexity and situational context of the phenomena – in this case, the social and cultural factors implicated in the execution, survival, and acceptance of deferred payment fraud in the livestock market ecosystem. Qualitative methods allow researcher understanding of meanings, rationales, and motives of participants, as well as the dominant social and cultural factors that characterize the participants' social environments. This is distinctly lacking in purely quantitative approaches.

I have drawn on routine activity theory and differential association theory, as discussed in the literature review. These theories complement each other. Routine activity theory adds to our understanding of the conditions in the environment that encourage fraudulent transactions, while differential association theory adds to our understanding of the processes of the learning, acceptance, and internalization of fraudulent practices and norms within the trading community. The combination of both theories allows for a thorough analysis of the micro and macro level processes that both translate into the social acceptance of fraudulent practices and the prolonged repetition of fraudulent behavior.

This research uses primary and secondary sources. Primary data were collected from a series of in-depth, semi-structured interviews and field observations in the big livestock markets in the provinces of Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa during the 2024 and 2025 Eid-ul-Adha seasons. The victims of the fraudulent deferred payment scheme and market intermediaries and brokers, veterinary officers, and representatives of local trade associations, were interviewed. The interviews focused on the participant's fraud experience, their understanding of the factors involved in the fraudulent scheme, and their opinions on possible institutional and regulatory frameworks. For the secondary data, I used policy papers and Acts, media articles, and scholarly articles on the nexus of financial crimes and AML, as well as literature pertaining to the livestock sector.

Thematic analysis (in line with the work of Braun and Clarke) was used to determine the main themes of interest in the data. The analysis has six different stages: familiarization with the data, code generation, theme searching, consultation with the reviewers, definition and naming of themes, and the final drafting of the report. Several techniques were used to check the trustworthiness of the findings. These involved use of multiple data sources, member checking, and reflective journaling to identify and eliminate potential researcher biases. Ethical clearance to conduct the research was obtained.

ISSN: 3007-2115
Publisher: Allied Nexus Publisher
http://amss.alliednexuspublisher.com/

Archives of Management and Social Sciences
2026, Vol: 03, Issue: 01, Page No. 70 – 85
RESEARCH ARTICLE OPEN ACCESS

4. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

4.1. An Analysis of the Mechanics of Deferred Payment Fraud in Livestock Markets

This research unravels complex mechanisms of deferred payment fraud in livestock markets. Deferred payment fraud begins with the appearance of premise/group of buyers in a particular market, where members often display wealth and social capital. Research participants indicated that the buyers drive double cabin pickup trucks, and immediately use their social capital and personal connections to get established. One participant in this study described the process as follows, “They come in like they own the place. Everyone knows someone who knows them. They say "I am so-and-so’s relative, I buy for so-and-so." Before you know it, half the market is vouching for them.”

Credibility established, buyers systematically apply a strategy of price acceptance that reveals the market’s sellers’ greed. Instead of making offers to buy at successively lower prices, sellers accept prices that are systematically higher. As one participant in this study described it, “You tell them the price is one million rupees. They say done. You say one and a half million. They say done. You push it to two million, and they still say done. You think you have hit the jackpot.

That is how they get you.’ This reversed negotiation procedure offers two services. The first is to stimulate sellers’ excitement and induce them to give in to their judgment and imagine a possible substantial gain. The second is to provide the buyer with a big, yet largely imagined, ‘investment’ that gives the buyer the ability to minimize the real payment.

The key to this scheme is the deferred payment arrangement. The buyers, after purchasing the livestock at an inflated price, draw up an agreement setting a date on or before Eid-ul-Adha for complete payment. The date is purposely selected to take advantage of the seasonal changes in the market. The market for larger, more expensive animals, especially bulls, camels, and large goats, often experiences a drop in demand and prices leading up to Eid-ul-Adha. Having purchased the livestock at the highest price, the cash buyers sell the animals at lower prices and sustain a large loss, while keeping a portion of the funds for the payment to the original sellers.

ISSN: 3007-2115
Publisher: Allied Nexus Publisher
http://amss.alliednexuspublisher.com/

Buyers are breaking the agreement by offering a fraction of the price when it is time to pay. They say that they are losing money because of the market and ask for more time to pay. They do this all the time until the original seller has almost no money from the agreement. The buyers then go to new areas to sell to new people. This happens many times, and many different people are victims of fraud. The following sections describe how this happens in more detail.

4.2. Social Capital and Reputation Exploitation

Social capital is an important part of a type of fraud that is about not paying on time. In the developing world, cash traders do not use credit checks to assess a potential buyer's credit worthiness. Instead, they use a potential buyer's social capital. Because farmers and rural traders sell their animals in local markets, cash traders will buy animals from them only if a farmer has a buyer who is known and respected socially. In these cases, credit checks are irrelevant. This type of fraud relies on social capital and the traditional trust that is the foundation of cash trading, and exploitation of credibility. The majority of criminals who were studied exploit social capital and trust to a high degree to develop their social networks.

Participants described how fraudsters utilize a network which has several tiers to it. At the top, there is a single individual who runs the network and manages relationships with several sub-agents who act as middlemen and reference providers. These sub-agents introduce the buyer to sellers in different markets, and lease their reputation/credibility as well as their finances to back the introduction and the ensuing transactions. Middlemen create a perception of operational legitimacy that is difficult for individual farmers to penetrate, in part because the middlemen are sometimes oblivious to the fraudulent nature of the schemes or are actively participating in them. In many cultures, the informal social cost of verifying buyers' credibility through the formal means (i.e. background check, bank guarantees) is perceived as quite high, since such measures are considered a grave affront to the buyer's honor and social standing.

The transient nature of the fraud operations facilitates the exploitation of social capital. After a network exhausts the credit capacity of a specific market (i.e. when the accumulated debts exceed sellers' tolerance for non-payment), operators move to a new geographic area, often a different district or province, to establish a new identity through social connections and references. This pattern of geographic mobility greatly inhibits victims' ability to obtain legal recourse and the ability of law enforcement to identify and prosecute the operators. The fraud, in essence, operates as a nomadic enterprise, continually moving to new areas where the operators'

Archives of Management and Social Sciences
2026, Vol: 03, Issue: 01, Page No. 70 – 85
RESEARCH ARTICLE OPEN ACCESS

reputation is yet to be established and where a new clientele is yet to be exploited (Ashraf and Rehman, 2025).

4.3. Market Dynamics, Price Manipulation, and AML Vulnerabilities

The fraud is enabled and amplified by the seasonal nature of the livestock market. Prior to Eid-ul-Adha, the market for sacrificial animals undergoes a substantial increase in demand with a concomitant increase in prices. This period brings about fundamental changes to the market as it becomes a high-volume, high-value, and highly competitive market that brings buyers and sellers from across the country to a previously stable, locally oriented market. The presence of speculative trading and the emotional and religious nature of sacrificial animal purchases further weaken normal market forces (Bokhari and Ali, 2024).

The artificial inflation of livestock prices has a variety of causes. First, speculative traders often purchase livestock well in advance of Eid-ul-Adha, creating an artificial scarcity by hoarding a substantial portion of the stock. Second, as noted previously, the existence of fraudulent buyers has a distortion effect on prices. They are willing to pay prices above market value. Third, the开花高手 social media phenomenon of displaying expensive sacrificial animals has created a preference for more expensive and exotic breeds. The combination of these factors results in a price increase that benefits traders and intermediaries. Farmers and end consumers, however, bear the negative effects of higher prices. From the AML point of view, the market phenomena described create numerous risks. Large volumes of cash and near cash transactions together with informal credit arrangements, and involvement of many intermediaries, create an environment of layering and integration of the money laundering process (Financial Action Task Force, 2023b). A buyer with unreported funds can purchase livestock on credit, sell the livestock at a loss, and use the resulting cash as an explanation for the origin of unreported income. The nature of the fraud operations--repetitive and transnational--complicates the tracing of financial flows and the identification of beneficial ownership (Rehman and Waqas, 2025).

4.4. The Commercialization of Eid-ul-Adha and Its Impact on Religious Practice

The effects of the commercialization of Eid-ul-Adha on the Qurbani ritual have been documented. Concerns were expressed almost unanimously about the impact of the commodification of sacrifices on the Sunnah. Specifically, how the extremely high prices charged for sacrificial animals, due in part to fraud, makes it increasingly difficult for most Muslim families to carry out this practice. Formerly, this practice of worshipping God was affordable even for the poor who could purchase a small animal. Now, it is beyond the reach of most people and has become a show of wealth.

ISSN: 3007-2115
Publisher: Allied Nexus Publisher
http://amss.alliednexuspublisher.com/

It was observed that the market for commercializing livestock and the erosion of Eid-ul-Adha are interrelated. One such market observers noted that “Eid-ul-Adha is the remembrance of the sacrifice of Ibrahim and Ismail, peace be upon them both. It is the remembrance of humility and submission to God. But look around you, people are buying animals that are not for God, but for posting in social media. The meaning is completely gone”. It was also noted by religious scholars interviewed for this study that the Prophet Muhammad (SAWW) meant the practice of Qurbani to be a practice of unity and community and remembrance of the sacrifice of the prophets, rather than a source of social inequity and financial burden.

The change of Qurbani from a ritual to a trade good has its ramifications on social interactions and how people practice their faith. When carrying out Qurbani becomes financially burdensome, some families are forced to stay out of the ritual which may lead to feelings of exclusion and inferiority to other participants; thereby defeating the goal of the event to unify the community. In addition, focusing on costly and exotic animals has made participants lose focus of the essence of the ritual, which is sacrifice, to the show of the animal prior to the sacrifice. It has promoted a culture of show-off, which is contrary to the way the Prophet Muhammad (SAWW) lived and exemplified, his life of simplicity and humility (Hassan and Farooq, 2024). The Hadith of Prophet Muhammad (SAWW) in Sahih Muslim, which states that whoever performed the slaughtering of the sacrifice before the performing of the prayer had sacrificed only for himself, and whoever performed it after the prayer, completed the sacrifice and the Sunnah of the Muslims; implies that the correctness of the ritual is paramount, and not the value or appearance of the sacrificed animal.

4.5 Regulatory Gaps and Compliance Challenges

The report defines key regulatory gaps contributing to continued deferred payment fraud and AML exposure in the livestock market. The first gap pertains to the absence of mandatory registration and licensing for livestock traders. This leads to no official record who participates in the market and consequently no official records that can be consulted to verify the financial health or trading history of the traders. Although some larger market associations have informal record keeping systems, these are neither comprehensive nor accessible to government agencies or market participants. The absence of a mandatory documentation system for transactions means that when fraud occurs victims have little evidence to support a legal claim.

The Australian market lacks an AML framework specific to livestock markets. There are no provisions in the AMLA 2010 or subsequent amendments for agricultural markets or livestock. The FMU’s suspicious transaction reporting framework does not cover market level participants. There is no mechanism to systematically

Archives of Management and Social Sciences
2026, Vol: 03, Issue: 01, Page No. 70 – 85
RESEARCH ARTICLE
OPEN ACCESS

monitor cash flows in the livestock market. The multi-jurisdictional nature of livestock markets poses challenges for law enforcement agencies which lack the legislative mandate and resources to conduct cross - border investigations (Pakistan FMU, 2025).

Fifth, the cultural peculiarities of informal livestock trading systems create a disparity between the formal reporting systems and the actual reporting of fraud in relation to livestock trading systems. These include informal resolution of disputes, refusal to engage the courts or even the police for resolution of trading disputes and social norms which discourage reporting of cases of trading fraud. As a result, reporting of cases of fraud in livestock trading is significantly under-reported. Participants in the study reported a culture of silence where victims of fraud in livestock trading are discouraged from reporting because of anticipated social queries and victim shaming, perceived ineffectiveness of the formal justice system, and fear of reprisals. The combination of unstructured regulations and these cultural issues creates a vacuum where criminals are able to carry out their activities, especially trading in stolen livestock without concern for the Anti- Money Laundering provisions.

5. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This study has considered the relationships of non-cash transactions, deferred payment fraud, and AML compliance in terms of Pakistan's livestock markets from a criminological perspective. These relationships describe mechanisms and situations that characterize a particular informal economy and the kind of fraud that is associated with such markets. These relationships are systematic and recurrent and show how interconnected buyers/traders operate trust-based, informal, and seasonally unpredictable livestock markets to defraud farmers and create significant ex postures to money laundering and other financial crimes.

The research shows that deferred payment fraud should not be viewed as an isolated case of an unethical person, but rather should be recognized as a form of financial crime that is systematically integrated into the social, cultural, and institutional order of livestock markets and, therefore, should be dealt with in a comprehensive and tailored way by the criminal justice system. The fraud that occurs within these networks combines elements including the intentional movement to out-of-town locations, the intentional lack of formal documentation, the manipulation of seasonal markets, and a high level of criminal organization that justifies a corresponding high level of control.

This study identifies the profit-driven activities associated with fraud that generate social and religious problems

ISSN: 3007-2115
Publisher: Allied Nexus Publisher
http://amss.alliednexuspublisher.com/

and increase the cost of livestock during commercialization of Eid-ul-Adha and the subsequent increase in demand to cover the need for animal sacrifice as a part of the Islamic obligation of Qurbani. Consequently, Qurbani has transitioned from the not status of an inexpensive act of worship to an expensive act for rich people and a severe financial burden on poor farmers and families. This complete disregard of the occasion runs contrary to the spirit of the festivity. During this time, the Prophet Muhammad (SAWW), the message of Ibrahim (PBUH) and Ismail (PBUH), and some of the Quranic verses regarding the significance of sacrifice, illuminate the opportunity to eliminate the abuse of commerce at this time.

Based on the findings of the study, some policy and practice related recommendations have been developed. First, the Government of Pakistan should consider establishing a mandatory registration and licensing procedure for large livestock traders. This system would require the major livestock traders to register and report their transactions, and would enable the Government of Pakistan to retain records required for controlling fraud and meeting the requirements of anti-money laundering policy. Second, large transactions in the livestock market should be subject to anti-money laundering regulations, and market specific regulations should be designed to address the market related risks.

Third, investing in new technology to digitize cash payments and record keeping will improve transparency of livestock market transactions by eliminating cash and informal transactions. Fourth, government initiatives to educate farmers on advance fee fraud should promote simple preventative measures such as contracts, third party guarantees, and endorsement checks to buyers. Fifth, special training and supporting tools to enhance inter-jurisdiction financial intelligence and tort prosecution collaboration should be offered to financial crime investigation and prosecution units of law enforcement agencies.

Sixth, the most important contribution to this discourse by the entire society should be aimed at an understanding of the true meaning and spirit of Eid-ul-Adha as presented in the Quran and the teachings of Prophet Muhammad (SAWW). Together, religious leaders, teachers, and the media should join efforts to eradicate the culture of obnoxious and vulgar celebrations and festivities and bring back the spirit of humility, compassion and the spirit that Qurbani strives to promote. Only a concerted effort of all the parties will make the livestock market a market that satisfies the needs of farmers and the desires of the Muslim community.

REFERENCES

Ahmed, S. and Raza, M. (2023), 'Informal credit systems in agricultural markets: a review of evidence from South Asia', Journal of Development Studies, Vol. 59 No. 8, pp. 1456-1472.

Akhlaq, A. and Ahmed, R. (2025), 'The fraud triangle and white-collar crime in developing economies: a systematic review', International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice, Vol. 78, 101289.

Ashraf, M. and Rehman, F. (2025), 'Nomadic fraud networks in Pakistan's informal markets: a qualitative investigation', Pakistan Journal of Criminology, Vol. 17 No. 1, pp. 34-58.

Bokhari, S. and Ali, H. (2024), 'Seasonal price dynamics in Pakistan's livestock markets: the Eid-ul-Adha effect', Agricultural Economics Research Review, Vol. 37 No. 2, pp. 231-248.

Braun, V. and Clarke, V. (2023), 'Thematic analysis: a practical guide', SAGE Publications, London.

Chaikin, D. and Sharman, J.C. (2023), 'Corruption and money laundering: a symbiotic relationship', Palgrave Macmillan, London.

Cohen, L.E. and Felson, M. (1979), 'Social change and crime rate trends: a routine activity approach', American Sociological Review, Vol. 44 No. 4, pp. 588-608.

Cressey, D.R. (1953), 'Other people's money: a study in the social psychology of embezzlement', Free Press, Glencoe, IL.

Creswell, J.W. and Poth, C.N. (2024), 'Qualitative inquiry and research design: choosing among five approaches', 4th ed., SAGE Publications, Thousand Oaks, CA. Economic Survey of Pakistan (2024), 'Chapter 2: Agriculture', Ministry of Finance, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad.

Emmanuel, D., Chikaire, J., Ogujiofor, L. and Nnadi, F. (2023), 'Fraud in agricultural markets: typologies and interventions in Sub-Saharan Africa', Journal of Agribusiness in Developing and Emerging Economies, Vol. 13 No. 3, pp. 412-430.

FAO (2024), 'Informal livestock trade and financial integrity risks in developing countries', Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Rome.

Financial Action Task Force (2023a), 'FATF Recommendations: international standards on combating money laundering and the financing of terrorism and proliferation', FATF, Paris.

Financial Action Task Force (2023b), 'Opportunities and challenges of new technologies for AML/CFT', FATF, Paris.

Financial Action Task Force (2024), 'Mutual Evaluation Report: Pakistan', FATF, Paris.

Hassan, M. and Farooq, S. (2024), 'Commercialisation of religious festivals in Muslim societies: the case of Eid-ul-

Adha', Islamic Studies Quarterly, Vol. 42 No. 3, pp. 289-306.

Hussain, A. and Malik, S. (2023), 'Cash-based transactions and regulatory evasion in Pakistan's agricultural sector', Pakistan Development Review, Vol. 62 No. 4, pp. 567-584.

Iqbal, K. and Rahman, S. (2025), 'Behavioural vulnerabilities in high-stakes agricultural trading environments', Journal of Economic Psychology, Vol. 101, 102612.

Khan, A. and Shah, S. (2024), 'Deceptive practices in livestock markets: evidence from Punjab, Pakistan', South Asian Journal of Policy and Governance, Vol. 8 No. 1, pp. 67-85.

Khan, M., Ahmad, N. and Siddiqui, D. (2024), 'Social capital, trust, and fraud in informal economies', Journal of Financial Crime, Vol. 31 No. 5, pp. 1234-1252.

Mahmood, S. and Noor, Z. (2024), 'From Sunnah to spectacle: the evolving economics of Qurbani in urban Pakistan', Journal of Islamic Economics and Finance, Vol. 10 No. 2, pp. 178-195.

Pakistan FMU (2025), 'Annual Report 2024', Financial Monitoring Unit, State Bank of Pakistan, Islamabad.

Rashid, T. and Bari, F. (2023), 'The political economy of livestock markets in Pakistan', Lahore Journal of Economics, Vol. 28 No. 2, pp. 211-230.

Raza, T. and Ahmad, F. (2023), 'Money laundering risks in informal value transfer systems: the case of hawala and its variants', Journal of Money Laundering Control, Vol. 26 No. 4, pp. 601-618.

Regehr, K. and Bressler, M. (2024), 'Applying routine activity theory to agricultural crime: a conceptual framework', Rural Criminology, Vol. 7 No. 1, pp. 45-64.

Rehman, A. and Waqas, H. (2025), 'Layering of illicit funds through informal agricultural markets', International Journal of Financial Crime Management, Vol. 3 No. 1, pp. 78-96.

Reuter, P. (2024), 'Draining the swamp? The limits of anti-money laundering policy', Crime and Justice, Vol. 53 No. 1, pp. 1-36.

Sherif, R. and Ashraf, Y. (2024), 'Differential association and the normalisation of fraud in trading communities', Deviant Behavior, Vol. 45 No. 8, pp. 1021-1039.

Siddique, A. (2024), 'Informal economy and AML compliance in South Asia: challenges and prospects', Asian Journal of Comparative Law, Vol. 19 No. 1, pp. 134-157.

State Bank of Pakistan (2025), 'AML/CFT Compliance Guidelines for Non-Banking Financial Institutions', SBP, Karachi.

Sutherland, E.H. (1947), 'Principles of criminology', 4th ed., J.B. Lippincott, Philadelphia.

Ullah, S., Akhtar, W. and Khan, J. (2024a), 'Non-cash transactions and financial crime vulnerabilities in Pakistan's livestock sector', Journal of Financial Regulation and Compliance, Vol. 32 No. 1, pp. 89-107.

Ullah, S., Khan, J. and Akhtar, W. (2024b), 'Trust-based fraud in informal markets: evidence from the livestock trade in Pakistan', International Journal of Criminology and Sociological Theory, Vol. 17 No. 3, pp. 245-263.